

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
AT CHARLESTON**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL 2327</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO: WAVE 3 CASES</b>	<b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>

**MOTION TO EXCLUDE THE OPINIONS AND  
TESTIMONY OF DUANE B. PRIDDY, PH.D.**

Defendants Ethicon, Inc., Ethicon LLC, and Johnson & Johnson (“Ethicon”) move to exclude the opinions and testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D. Dr. Priddy’s proposed opinion testimony is unreliable and irrelevant under the standard set forth in *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharm., Inc.*, 509 U.S. 579 (1993). Ethicon incorporates its Memorandum in Support of Motion to Exclude The Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D., and also the following exhibits:

<b>Exhibit</b>	<b>Description</b>
A	List of cases to which this motion applies;
B	<i>Huskey</i> 8/25/2014 Trial Transcript;
C	Scott Guelcher 3/23/16 Deposition Transcript;
D	Duane Priddy 3/8/16 Deposition Transcript;
E	Jimmy Mays 3/2/16 Deposition Transcript;
F	Duane Priddy Expert Report;

- G de la Rie, *Polymer Stabilizers: A Survey with Reference to Possible Applications in the Conservation Field*, 33 *Studies in Conservation* 9–22 (1988);
- H ASTM 3895-14;
- I Costello's *Materials Characterization of Explanted Hernia Meshes*, 83B *J. Biomed. Mater. Res Part B: Appl Biomater* 44 (2007);
- J Clave, *et al.*, *Polypropylene As A Reinforcement In Pelvic Surgery Is Not Inert: Comparative Analysis of 100 Explants*, 21 *Int. Urogynecol. J.* 261, 266 (2010);
- K A.J. Wood, *et al.*, *Materials Characterization and Histological Analysis of Explanted Polypropylene, PTFE, and PET Hernia Meshes from an Individual Patient*, 24 *J. Mater. Sci. Mater. Med.* 1113 (2013);
- L T. Liebert, *et al.*, *Subcutaneous Implants of PP Filaments*, 10 *J. Biomed. Mater. Res.* 939, 941 (1976);
- M Scott Guelcher 3/25/14 Deposition Transcript;
- N D.F. Williams, 17 *Biodegradation of Surgical Polymers*, *J. of Mater. Sci.* 1233 (1982);
- O G. Sternschuss, Donald Ostergard, *et al.*, *Post-Implantation Alterations of Polypropylene in the Human*, 188 *J. of Urology* 27, 30-31 (2012);
- P W. Jongebloed & J. Worst, *Degradation of Polypropylene in the Human Eye: A SEM Study*, 64 *Documenta Opthamologica* 143 (1986);
- Q W. Jongebloed, *et al.*, *Mechanical and Biochemical Effects of Man-Made Fibers and Metals in the Human Eye, A SEM Study*, 61 *Documenta Opthamologica* 303 (1986);
- R A. Altman, *et al.*, *The Breakdown of Polypropylene in the Human Eye: Is It Clinically Significant?*, 18 *Ann. Ophthalmol* 182 (1986);
- S L. Miao, *et al.*, *Physical Characteristics of Medical Textile Prostheses Designed for Hernia Repair: A Comprehensive Analysis of Select Commercial Devices*, 8 *Materials* 8148, 8151 (2015);
- T M. Lundback, *et al.*, 91 *Loss of Stability by Migration and Chemical Reaction of Santonox R in Branched Polyethylene Under Anaerobic and Aerobic Conditions* 1071 (2006);

- U W, B. Bell, D. Priddy, *et al.*, 54 *Permanence of Polymer Stabilizers in Hostile Environments* 1605 (1994);
- V J. Arutchelvi, *et al.*, *Biodegradation of Polyethylene and Polypropylene*, 7 *Indian J. of Biotechnology* 9 (2008);
- W A. Imel, *et al.*, *In vivo Oxidative Degradation of Polypropylene Pelvic Mesh*, 73 *Biomaterials* 131, 132 (2015);
- X Scott Guelcher 12/18/14 Deposition Transcript;
- Y U. Klinge & B. Klosterhalfen, *Modified Classification of Surgical Meshes for Hernia Repair Based on the Analyses of 1,000 Explanted Meshes*, 16 *Hernia* 251 (2012);
- Z V. Iakovlev, *et al.*, *Degradation of Polypropylene In Vivo: A Microscopic Analysis of Meshes Explanted From Patients*, *J. Biomed. Mater. Res. Part B* (2015);
- AA V. Iakovlev, *et al.*, *Pathology of Explanted Transvaginal Meshes*, 8 *Int. J. of Med., Health, Pharm., and Biomed. Engineering* 510 (2014);
- BB Howard Jordi 10/30/13 Deposition Transcript;
- CC IR Microscopy of Explanted Prolene (Sept. 30, 1987), ETH.MESH.12831391–1404;
- DD ETH.MESH.12729337;
- EE ETH.MESH.07690752;
- FF ETH.MESH.05453719;
- GG ETH.MESH.11336184;
- HH ETH.MESH.11336071;
- II ETH.MESH.11336165
- JJ ETH.MESH.09888187; and
- KK ETH.MESH.11336181.

WHEREFORE, FOR THESE REASONS and as more fully set forth in Ethicon's supporting memorandum of law, Ethicon respectfully requests that this Court enter an order granting Ethicon's Motion to Exclude the Opinions and Testimony of Duane B. Priddy, Ph.D.

Respectfully submitted,

ETHICON, INC., ETHICON LLC, AND  
JOHNSON & JOHNSON

/s/ David B. Thomas

David B. Thomas (W.Va. Bar #3731)  
THOMAS COMBS & SPANN PLLC  
300 Summers Street  
Suite 1380 (25301)  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 25338  
Telephone: 304.414.1807  
dthomas@tcspllc.com

/s/ Christy D. Jones

Christy D. Jones  
BUTLER SNOW LLP  
1020 Highland Colony Parkway  
Suite 1400 (39157)  
P.O. Box 6010  
Ridgeland, MS 39158-6010  
Telephone: 601.985.4523  
christy.jones@butlersnow.com

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA  
AT CHARLESTON**

<b>IN RE: ETHICON, INC., PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION</b>	<b>Master File No. 2:12-MD-02327 MDL 2327</b>  <b>JOSEPH R. GOODWIN U.S. DISTRICT JUDGE</b>
<b>THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO: WAVE 3 CASES</b>	

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I certify that on September 19, 2016, I electronically filed this document with the clerk of the court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of this filing to CM/ECF participants registered to receive service in this MDL.

/s/ David B. Thomas

David B. Thomas (W.Va. Bar #3731)  
THOMAS COMBS & SPANN PLLC  
300 Summers St.  
Suite 1380 (25301)  
P.O. Box 3824  
Charleston, WV 25338  
Telephone: 304.414.1807  
dthomas@tcspllc.com